**Critical Review Video Lesson**

**1. Definitions**

*A critical review (sometimes called a critique, critical commentary, critical appraisal, critical analysis) is a detailed commentary on and critical evaluation of a text. To be critical does not mean to criticise in an exclusively negative manner. To be critical of a text means you question the information and opinions in the text, in an attempt to evaluate or judge its worth overall (University of Southampton, 2024).*

*A critical review is not just a summary. It is an evaluation of what an author has said about a topic. It is critical in the sense that it is a thoughtful consideration of the validity and accuracy of the author's claims; considers the benefits and limitations of the author's point of view; and identifies other valid points of view (Monash University, 2024).*

**2. Critical Review Outline**

Fill in the outline:

|  |
| --- |
| **Introduction (\_\_\_)** **Summary (\_\_\_)** *

**Evaluation (\_\_\_\_)** *

**Conclusion (\_\_\_)**  |

**3. Evaluation Focus Questions**

Fill in the gaps:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Criteria** | **Possible focus questions** |
| Significance and contribution to the field | * What is the author's \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_? Has this been achieved?
* What does this text add to the body of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_? This could be in terms of theory, data and/or practical application
 |
| Methodology or approach  | * What \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ was used for the research?
* (e.g., quantitative, or qualitative, \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_, comparative, case study, etc…)
* How objective/\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ is the approach?
 |
| Argument and use of evidence | * What \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ are made?
* Is the argument consistent?
* What kinds of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_is used? Is this evidence valid and reliable?
 |

**4. Evaluation Language Phrases**

Identify which of these are strengths or limitations:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| *1. One of the strengths of the text is that…**2. The main limitation is that …**3. The text is a detailed, well-researched and rigorous account of...**4. The main weakness of the study is the failure to address how …**5. The author provides a plausible explanation for…**6. The author fails to acknowledge / consider the significance of …*  | *7. The author fails to fully define what …**8. This text proves to be significant / timely due to...**9. The author overlooks the fact that …**10. The author provides a range of illustrative / specific / useful / examples to support…**11.The author provides conflicting / inadequate / limited evidence on…**12. The author provides extensive / compelling / persuasive / substantial / evidence on…* |

**5. Analyse a Critical Response**

**Evaluation**

One of the strengths of the lecture is that Dannouni points out that while there exists concern regarding the potential adverse impact of online marketplaces on employment, wages and local businesses, online marketplaces have also exhibited positive effects, such as reducing gender discrimination… The main limitation of the lecture is that the speaker argues the emergence of online marketplaces from the perspective of an economist; however, most of his propositions are based on his own position and experience, lacking sufficient factual evidence and data support. He fails to cite any quantitative or qualitative data to demonstrate… In addition, there are several crucial questions left unanswered such as when Dannouni claims “they [online marketplaces] can find better matches, do it faster, and ultimately, unlock more value for everyone”. This unfounded assumption is biased and falls short in convincing audiences that everyone benefits, because…

Video lesson: <https://youtu.be/4abnt_Gcx0U>